

Objections to the Proposal to Close Ysgol Clocaenog and Ysgol Cyffylliog and to establish a new area school

Under section 49 of the 2013 Act proposers must publish a summary of the statutory objections and the proposer's response to those objections ("the Objections Report").

Number of objections received:

16

Includes:

Point Raised	LA Response	Number of Written Responses Raising Point	% of Responses Raising Point
1 We are happy with current provision. Don't agree with the proposal.	The review has concluded that retaining the Status Quo is not the preferred option. Ysgol Cyffylliog is currently a very small school and retaining the school would not address any of the issues identified as part of the Ruthin review.	10	63%
2 The Ysgol Cyffylliog building is fit for purpose.	The authority is of the view that investment will be required in Ysgol Cyffylliog should the school remain open in the medium term. The recent condition survey for the school ranked the school building as "Poor". The school requires investment in catering facilities and doesn't have an indoor space suitable for use for physical education. Ysgol Cyffylliog is the worst performing building within the Ruthin area review in terms of energy use per m2 (£16/m2).	2	13%
3 The proposal will have a detrimental effect on the education of the children as the process is disruptive.	The authority will work closely with the Temporary Governing Body and the new Head teacher to make arrangements for the new school and to minimise disruption for pupils. Estyn have determined that this proposal will at least maintain the present standards of education provision.	1	6%
4 The proposal will fail in its aims to save money and will not reduce overall environmental impact.	The authority is of the opinion that this proposal is the best option for retaining primary education provision in the Clocaenog/Cyffylliog area. The aim as set out in the informal consultation document is to ensure the education provision is of the right type, in the right place and of the right size. The authority acknowledges that the current proposal will cost more financially and environmentally but has demonstrated that the second phase would address both of these issues.	2	13%
5 The proposal doesn't provide greater economy due to additional transport costs and a new school will cost over £1m.	The authority has acknowledged that this option isn't the 'cheap' option. This proposal has educational benefits that include reducing the age range taught together, increasing the teaching capacity and developing a more robust leadership and management structure. Whilst the provision of any new school is outside the direct remit of this proposal investing in a new building would provide a fit for purpose modern facility that would ensure parity of facilities to pupils from a rural area.	4	25%
6 The carbon footprint of the schools will increase because of the additional travel and embodied energy of the new building.	It is acknowledged that the carbon footprint of the new area school will be higher than current provision due to the additional transport that will be provided. The authority will work with the Temporary Governing Body to minimise disruption in terms of where year groups are based for teaching.	2	13%
7 Retaining use of the existing Ysgol Cyffylliog site is more cost effective as a modest investment would reduce environmental impact.	The authority acknowledges that investing in reducing environmental impact in Ysgol Cyffylliog would reduce the running costs of Ysgol Cyffylliog. However the authority doesn't believe that upgrading the current building fabric is best use of resources as the current building would require a disproportionate amount of funding in comparison to other better performing school buildings.	2	13%
8 The proposal will increase transport with children moved backwards and forwards between two sites. This is disruptive for children, expensive, increasing risk and environmentally damaging.	It is acknowledged that this proposal will mean that some pupils will travel between the two sites. The extent of how many pupils will travel will be the decision for the Temporary Governing Body and Head teacher as they will decide which age groups are taught on each site.	8	50%
9 A new area school will fail to serve the needs of families in the Cyffylliog area. The road connection is not a suitable route for buses, taxis, staff of parents and will create congestion.	The road between Clocaenog and Cyffylliog is a small rural lane. It is used by public transport service number 70 as part of its Ruthin local service.	5	31%
10 Prefer to federate both schools to overcome problem of recruiting Head teachers.	Federating both school wouldn't address the issues of surplus/deficit in space in each school or the overall deficit in facilities.	2	13%
11 Ysgol Clocaenog school should have an extension or a bigger school.	It would be difficult to justify investment in Ysgol Clocaenog without considering the impact on nearby schools and the current large surplus at Ysgol Cyffylliog. Providing a new school for Ysgol Clocaenog would not ensure parity of facilities for Cyffylliog and could undermine the catchment of Ysgol Cyffylliog which already is a very small school.	1	6%
12 Investment in renewable energy would reduce running costs of Ysgol Cyffylliog.	The authority acknowledges that investing in reducing the environmental impact of Ysgol Cyffylliog would reduce the running costs of the school. Further work would be required to determine if any upgrade of the building fabric is viable.	1	6%
13 The population of Cyffylliog is forecast to grow and the school is projected to have as few as 10 surplus places by 2017.	The authority acknowledges that Ysgol Cyffylliog is projected to grow. If the school were to grow to 35 pupils it would remain a small school with a small catchment area and vulnerable to future fluctuations in pupil numbers.	3	19%
14 Parents will send their children to another school as it will not be bilingual.	It is not anticipated that the standards of outcomes in English and Welsh will be significantly changed by the proposal. The normal expectation for pupils attending a Welsh medium school is that pupils, regardless of home language, will be able to transfer easily to Welsh Medium secondary provision and by the end of junior stage will have reached a standard in English equivalent to that reached by pupils in predominantly English medium schools.	8	50%
15 There should be land bought by now if you are proposing to open a new school for September 2015.	The Cabinet confirmed their commitment to work towards delivering a new area school on one site subject to the availability of capital funding at their meeting on the 17th of December 2013. The authority hasn't committed to opening a new area school in September 2015 as the final decision to establish a new area school has not been made.	1	6%
16 The major concerns and questions of parents and governors haven't been answered.	All responses submitted during the consultation periods have been considered by the decision makers. Responses have been provided to all questions and comments raised both in the Cabinet report 17 December 2013 - Appendix E and in parent meetings arranged in the school.	3	19%
17 Why haven't you considered putting portacabins at the Clocaenog school until a new school is built.	It is Denbighshire County Council policy to remove temporary accommodation from schools. There is a significant installation cost for bringing a temporary building on site and an ongoing monthly rental cost. In addition there needs to be space on site to locate the building. Installing temporary accommodation 4.3 miles from a school with a significant surplus is not in the opinion of the authority best use of resources. The lack of space to locate a building at Ysgol Clocaenog eliminates this as a feasible option.	2	13%
18 Parents will move their children to other schools as they do not want their siblings to be split across two sites.	It is the intention of the Authority for all pupils to be retained in the area school. Although some siblings will be located on different sites the exact configuration will not be determined until the Head teacher and Temporary Governing Body have been appointed.	5	31%
19 Is it the intention of Denbighshire County Council for parents to move their children for town schools so you can avoid building a new school?	Denbighshire County Council Cabinet have approved an overarching vision for the Ruthin area which retains a mix of both rural and town schools. A new area school has been identified as the best option for the Clocaenog and Cyffylliog area due to the fact that most roads in the area are uncategorized and the travel time to Ruthin is increased as a result. As part of the proposal we would wish to retain where possible all pupils within the Clocaenog / Cyffylliog area.	1	6%
20 People feel pressurized into accepting the proposals.	The Authority accepts that this proposal has not been accepted by all parties although the majority of respondents during the formal consultation period supported the proposal. In many instances the community are concerned over the implications of proposals and should this proposal be implemented the authority will work with the Temporary Governing Body to reduce such concerns. The Temporary Governing Body will also need to ensure that the new area school serves both communities.	1	6%
21 Locating a new school in Clawddnewydd would be more acceptable because of better access and it is easier to be reached.	Locating a school in Clawddnewydd would mean that children living in the village of Cyffylliog would not be eligible for free home to school transport to the new school as it would not be their nearest suitable school	1	6%
22 Conduct of officers hasn't been professional. No acknowledgement has been provided to emails and letters that have been received. At the start of one meeting everyone was notified when the meeting would end before being welcomed.	All correspondence was acknowledged when an email address was provided. The Council has sought to be professional in its approach to holding meetings on what is a very difficult subject for all concerned.	1	6%
23 Not enough detail about education, wellbeing of pupils or importance of life in the countryside within the one side of A4 (Statutory Notice).	The Statutory notice follows a Welsh Government template. During the formal consultation a document was produced which addressed the details of the proposal and this is referenced on the statutory notice with details of the Council's website for Modernising Education	1	6%
24 Closing the school will be detrimental to the community. It is the heart of the community.	The review has concluded that retaining the Status Quo is not an option. As the current site will remain open as a result of the current proposal it has been determined that the proposal will have a neutral impact on the community.	7	44%
25 The consultation process was just a smoke screen and that decisions had already been made.	The Authority have followed the requirements of the School Organisation Code during the consultation period. At each stage of decision making the process has been considered as robust and all relevant issues have been considered by elected members before making any decision to proceed.	1	6%
26 The closure of Ysgol Llanbedr could lead to additional demand for non-Welsh medium education in small schools in the wider Ruthin area.	The review has concluded that sufficient capacity will remain for Welsh and non-Welsh provision in the Ruthin area should all proposals be approved	1	6%
27 There is no clear timetable for a single site school and funding for such a scheme is likely to be challenging.	The Cabinet confirmed their commitment to work towards delivering a new area school on one site subject to the availability of capital funding at their meeting on the 17th of December 2013. The Council has a commitment to investing in school buildings as part of its Corporate Plan.	1	6%